### Technical Paper Review Form

**Title:**

**Author(s):**

**Society Paper No.**

**Tech. Comm. Initials**

**Year**

**No.**

**Due date for review**

**Paper Review for** (Complete or check one)

- [ ] Committee
- [ ] Society Prize Paper
- [ ] Committee Prize Paper

**Paper Review Chairman**

**FAX**

**Tel:**

**Part I. For a paper to be accepted, Parts I, II, and III must be answered.**

A. What is the new contribution of this paper? (Please distinguish between what the author(s) state and what you believe to be an unbiased assessment.)

B. Based on your technical review effort, estimate the amount of time (days) you believe a knowledgable engineer would need to develop a working understanding of the paper’s contribution. (Note that excessive difficulty should be grounds for rejection.)

C. Does the title of the paper accurately reflect the major focus contribution of this paper? (Please suggest changes as appropriate.)

**Part II. Paper Numerical Score.** After reading the paper, provide scores for each item in Sections A & B on a scale of 0 to 10, 0-2 = poor, 3-5 = average, 6-8 = good, 9-10 = excellent. Total quality scores over 100 generally indicate a paper suitable for Transactions.

Note: It is important that the reviewer provide brief, written comments to support the scores on attached sheets of paper.


A. **Subject**
   1) Reader interest
   2) Importance
   3) Reference Value
   4) Originality
   5) Subtotal: sum of items A.1 to A.4
   6) Total: 2x item A.5

B. **Writing**
   1) Analysis and development: completeness and technical clarity
   2) Conciseness
   3) Clarity (in writing)
   4) References to past work other than just that of the authors
   5) Format, illustrations, tables
   6) Total: sum of items B.1 to B.5

C. Total quality evaluation: sum of items A.6 and B.6

**Part III. Reviewer Recommendations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transactions Recommendation</th>
<th>Prize Paper &amp; IAS Magazine Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accept for Transactions without change</td>
<td>Paper merit consideration for prize award? yes no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accept for Transactions with revision(s) specified*</td>
<td>Paper contents should be considered for use in the IAS Magazine? yes no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reject for Transactions (Give reasons*)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please note: A total score of 100 or above typically provides grounds for Transactions acceptance.

* Use separate sheets or a copy of the paper for comments and suggestions for revision.

Indicate whether revisions are mandatory or suggested.

Please use word processing, typed format if possible.

**Reviewer’s signature**

**Reviewer’s name**

**FAX:**

**Tel:**

**Reviewer’s address**